

Golden Gate Golf Course MPUD (PL20210001047)

Evaluation Criteria

Pursuant to LDC subsections 10.02.13 B, 10.02.08 F and Chapter 3 G. of the Administrative Code, staff's analysis and recommendation to the Planning Commission, and the Planning Commission's recommendation to the Board of County Commissioners shall be based upon consideration of the applicable criteria. Provide a narrative statement describing the rezone request with specific reference to the criteria below. Include any backup materials and documentation in support of the request.

The Golden Gate Golf Course Mixed-Use Planned Unit Development (MPUD) is a 172± acre property located on the southwest corner of the intersection of Golden Gate Parkway and Collier Boulevard. A majority of the property is designated Urban Mixed-Use District, Urban Residential Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. Approximately 1.9 +/- acres of the property are designated as the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. A companion small-scale growth management plan amendment for an approximate 20+/- acre portion of the site has been filed with Collier County in order to establish the Collier County Government Public Services, Residential Tourist and Commercial Subdistrict. This newly proposed subdistrict is located in the northwestern portion of the site adjacent to Golden Gate Parkway and will provide for up to 75,000 square feet of space for a variety of general governmental services 158 hotel units 98 timeshare or multi-family units, and up to 60,000 square feet of commercial uses consistent with the C-3 zoning district and up to 15,000 square feet of commercial uses consistent with the C-4 zoning district. All of the property is under the ownership of Collier County Government, with the exception of the 6.1+/- acre site which is currently operated as the Quality Inn and Suites Golf Resort.

The proposed MPUD rezoning will rezone 165+/- acres of land owned by Collier County Government and approximately 6.1+/- acres owned by Robert Vocisano in order to establish the Golden Gate Golf Course MPUD. At the time of the filing of the zoning application, approximately 163 acres are zoned GC, Golf Course and approximately 1.9+/- acres are zoned C-3, Intermediate Commercial, approximately .5+/- acres are zoned C-4, General Commercial, and approximately 6.1+/- acres are zoned RT, Residential Tourist. The portion of the MPUD owned by Collier County will provide for the continuation of the golf course use, with related driving range and entertainment complex, up to 400 affordable/workforce housing units, 75,000 square feet of governmental uses, 120 bed nursing home/assisted living facility, and 30,000 square feet of intermediate and general commercial uses. The Residential Tourist tract within the MPUD will permit hotel, timeshare, multi-family dwellings and up to 60,000 square feet of intermediate commercial uses. The MPUD will also make provisions for open space and approximately 16 acres of greenways in accordance with the LDC requirements for conversion of golf course property. The greenways are located adjacent to lands converted from the golf course use and neighboring residential dwellings.

The project and alternative greenway design have been vetted through the Intent to Convert (ITC) application review process, which included stakeholder outreach meetings (SOM) and summary report as required by the LDC and Collier County Administrative Code. A complete copy of the SOM summary is included in the PUD rezoning application back-up materials.

- a. The suitability of the area for the type and pattern of development proposed in relation to physical characteristics of the land, surrounding areas, traffic and access, drainage, sewer, water, and other utilities.

The property is suitable for the proposed mixed-use development. Collier County acquired 165+/- acres of the property with the intent to utilize the property for a variety of public purpose uses. The Intent to Convert (ITC) process included public input and opinion surveys with stakeholders to review three potential redevelopment scenarios. The County Commission recently elected to work with a golf course developer to renovate the existing 18-hole golf course into a 12-hole golf course with an entertainment/driving range component. Retaining golf and converting a portion of the overall site to support affordable/workforce housing, a potential veterans nursing home, government offices and intermediate commercial uses were discussed with the stakeholders.

Golden Gate City has been designated as an Economic Development Zone, which supports redevelopment of properties within the area through the capture of tax revenues. The conversion of a portion of the golf course will provide for future general governmental services, land for a nursing home/assisted living facility, a small commercial tract and up to 400 dwelling units targeted for workforce/affordable housing. The retention of the residential tourist district uses and inclusion of commercial uses on the 6.1 acre Residential Tourist tract are consistent with surrounding uses and furthers the goals of the Economic Development Zone. The mixed-use plans were discussed in two SOM's and based on the surveys taken of those participating, retention of the golf course was widely supported. Greenways will be provided between non-golf course and adjacent residential properties. The alternative design of the 11± acres greenways were addressed through the ITC process.

- b. Adequacy of evidence of unified control and suitability of any proposed agreements, contract, or other instruments, or for amendments in those proposed, particularly as they may relate to arrangements or provisions to be made for the continuing operation and maintenance of such areas and facilities that are not to be provided or maintained at public expense. Findings and recommendations of this type shall be made only after consultation with the county attorney.

The Collier County Board of County Commissioners is the owner of a majority of the property located within the proposed MPUD. Approximately 6.1+/- acres are owned by Robert Vocisano.

- c. Conformity of the proposed PUD with the goals, objectives and policies of the Growth Management Plan. (This is to include identifying what Sub-district, policy or other

provision allows the requested uses/density, and fully explaining/addressing all criteria or conditions of that Sub-district, policy or other provision.)

A majority of the property is designated Urban Mixed-Use District, Urban Residential Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. Approximately 1.9 +/- acres of the property are designated as the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. A companion small-scale growth management plan amendment for an approximate 20+/- acre portion of the site has been filed with Collier County in order to establish the Collier County Government Public Services, Residential Tourist and Commercial Subdistrict.

The proposed project is consistent with the Goals, Objectives and Policies of the Golden Gate Area Master Plan (GGAMP), Golden Gate City Sub-Element, and applicable Goals, Objectives and Policies of the Collier County Growth Management Plan.

Policy 1.1.4 of the GGAMP establishes The Urban Mixed Use District and Urban Residential Subdistrict. The Urban Mixed Use District description allows a variety of non-residential uses including essential services, parks, open space and recreational uses, community facility uses, public facility uses, and group housing uses. The proposed uses including the golf course, driving range, and nursing home/assisted living facility are consistent with the uses proposed. Policy 1.1.4 of the GGAMP also establishes the Urban-Commercial District, and the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict. The Parcel 1 commercial tract included in the MPUD will permit uses consistent with the C-1 through C-3 zoning districts and the tract is presently located in the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict, which permits the same uses as that proposed in the MPUD and is therefore consistent with the Commercial Infill Subdistrict. The Parcel 2 commercial tract is presently zoned C-4; however, it is designated Urban Residential Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Sub-element Future Land Use Map. The Residential Tourist tract is currently developed as a hotel and C-3 commercial uses consistent with the commercial zoning that currently exists on commercial parcel 1 and 2; however, it is currently designated Urban Residential Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Sub-element Future Land Use Map. The companion small-scale plan amendment will re-designate this small .5+/- acre parcel and the 6.1 acre parcel as a commercial tracts and will permit up to 15,000 square feet of commercial uses consistent with the C-4 zoning district on the .5 acre parcel and 60,000 square feet of commercial uses consistent with the C-3 zoning district on the 6.1 acre parcel.

The proposed affordable/workforce housing tract within the MPUD proposes to construct up to 400 multi-family dwelling units on a 25+/- acre portion of the site. The Collier County Board of County Commissioners, through a competitive bid process selected Rural Neighborhoods to develop the affordable/workforce housing component of the MPUD. The 400 units equates to a density of 16 dwelling units per acre over the 25-acre site. The Urban Residential Subdistrict density rating system permits a discretionary base density of four dwelling units per acre. Density bonuses are permitted for affordable housing a maximum bonus of up to 12 dwelling units per acre for qualifying income category housing.

While all of the property to be developed within the PUD for golf course and green ways uses would be eligible to be used for the calculation of residential density, this would equate to a maximum density of approximately 480 dwelling units at the base density of 4 dwelling units per acre and nearly 2,000 units if the affordable housing density bonus is utilized. The maximum of 400 dwelling proposed equates to a density of 16 dwelling units per acre over just the area to be leased by Rural Neighborhoods and an approximate density of 3.3 dwelling units per acre over the entire site. In either case, the density proposed is below that eligible under the density rating system. Rural Neighborhoods has entered into a Developer Agreement with Collier County, which identifies eligible income qualifying levels consistent with that outlined in the density rating system.

The MPUD also identifies a 13.5+/- acre tract which is the location where Collier County may establish up to 75,000 square feet of a variety of general governmental/public service uses and/or group housing uses. While some of the included uses are permitted by right in the Urban Residential Subdistrict, some of the proposed uses are not permitted; therefore, a companion small-scale amendment has been filed which proposes to establish the Collier County Government Public Services Subdistrict. The new subdistrict provides for a variety of general governmental, public service uses and institutional uses. The specific list of permitted uses in this MPUD are consistent with the allowed uses in the Subdistrict.

Objective 1.2 and Policy 1.2.1 require that projects must be consistent with level of service standards and concurrency requirements for public facilities as outlined in the Capital Facilities Element of the Growth Management Plan. There are no identified LOS deficiencies currently, nor anticipated with the redevelopment of the property as a mixed-use project. The MPUD is consistent with this Objective and Policy of the GGAMP.

Objective 1.3 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element requires the protection and preservation of natural resources within Golden Gate City. The property has been previously cleared and filled and has predominantly been utilized as a golf course since the 1960's. A vegetative analysis, including a tree survey, and listed species study has been completed and is included in this MPUD application. While the site does not contain native indigenous vegetation, the golf course conversion standards in the LDC do require preservation or replanting of many of the existing trees within the proposed greenways shown on the MPUD Conceptual Master Plan.

Objective 2.1 and Policy 2.1.1 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element require development and redevelopment to be guided by the residential and commercial needs consistent with the vision of Golden Gate City. This MPUD represents redevelopment of a defunct golf course and adjacent hotel site into a vibrant mixed-use project that will provide for both residential and non-residential uses consistent with expressed public policy for Golden Gate City.

Policy 2.3.2 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element provides that Collier County will support all transportation needs with an emphasis on walkability. The proposed MPUD provides for walkability both internal and external. Sidewalks will be provided along both the Collier Boulevard and Golden Gate Parkway frontages, which will also provide for the connection to the provided greenways within the project. A potential pedestrian interconnection is provided adjacent to the residential tract, which will provide the opportunity for area residents to access the southern portion of the greenway, and to provide linkages to the public schools located near the MPUD.

- d. The internal and external compatibility of proposed uses, which conditions may include restrictions on location of improvements, restrictions on design, and buffering and screening requirements.

The proposed MPUD has carefully arranged the various land uses in manner that assures compatibility with the surrounding area land uses. The arrangement of uses was discussed with area stakeholders in two outreach meetings. The golf course has been maintained in the area surrounding the Par One Condominium community, and where the golf course use is not to be continued, greenways are provided to buffer the neighboring single-family residences. The MPUD also provides for development standards appropriate for the redevelopment of the property.

- e. The adequacy of usable open space areas in existence and as proposed to serve the development.

The proposed open space is more than adequate for the MPUD. Open space will be provided in the form of the golf course tract as well as greenways and project buffers. The area retained specifically for golf course and greenways will exceed 115 acres which represents nearly 70% of the site which is more than double the 30% required for a mixed-use project. Other open space will be provided within each individual development tract and within standard project buffers.

- f. The timing or sequence of development for the purpose of assuring the adequacy of available improvements and facilities, both public and private.

The proposed development of the commercial and residential uses will not require phasing due to infrastructure availability. However, it will be a phased project due to the number of uses proposed to be developed. Adequate infrastructure is in place at the project site to service the proposed commercial uses.

- g. The ability of the subject property and of surrounding areas to accommodate expansion.

The MPUD boundary is not proposed to be expanded due to existing development and existing public roadways adjacent to the MPUD.

- h. Conformity with PUD regulations, or as to desirable modifications of such regulations in the particular case, based on determination that such modifications of justified as meeting public purposes to a degree at least equivalent to literal application of such regulations.

The MPUD includes development standards and conditions, which will assure compatible and complementary development.

10.02.08 - Requirements for Amendments to the Official Zoning Atlas

- F. Nature of requirements of Planning Commission report. When pertaining to the rezoning of land, the report and recommendations of the Planning Commission to the Board of County Commissioners required in LDC section 10.02.08 E shall show that the Planning Commission has studied and considered the proposed change in relation to the following findings, when applicable:
 - 1. Whether the proposed change will be consistent with the goals, objectives, and policies and future land use map and the elements of the Growth Management Plan.

The MPUD, as proposed, is consistent with the Future Land Use Element. A majority of the property is designated Urban Mixed-Use District, Urban Residential Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. Approximately 1.9 +/- acres of the property are designated as the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict on the Golden Gate City Future Land Use Map. A companion small-scale growth management plan amendment for an approximate 20+/- acre portion of the site has been filed with Collier County in order to establish the Collier County Government Public Services, Residential Tourist and Commercial Subdistrict.

The proposed project is consistent with the Goals, Objectives and Policies of the Golden Gate Area Master Plan (GGAMP), Golden Gate City Sub-Element, and applicable Goals, Objectives and Policies of the Collier County Growth Management Plan.

Policy 1.1.4 of the GGAMP establishes the Urban Mixed Use District and Urban Residential Subdistrict. The Urban Mixed Use District description allows a variety of non-residential uses including essential services, parks, open space and recreational uses, community facility uses, public facility uses, and group housing uses. The proposed uses including the golf course, driving range, and nursing home/assisted living facility are consistent with the uses proposed. Policy 1.1.4 of the GGAMP also establishes the Urban-Commercial District, and the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict. The commercial tracts included in the MPUD will permit uses consistent with the C-1 through C-4 zoning districts and the Parcel 1 is presently located in the Golden Gate Urban Commercial Infill Subdistrict, which permits the same uses as that proposed in the MPUD and is therefore consistent with the Commercial Infill Subdistrict. The Parcel 2 tract is located within the newly proposed Sub-district and the uses proposed are consistent with the uses provided in the Subdistrict.

The proposed affordable/workforce housing tract within the MPUD proposes to construct up to 400 multi-family dwelling units on a 25+/- acre portion of the site. The Collier County Board of County Commissioners, through a competitive bid process selected Rural Neighborhoods to develop the affordable/workforce housing component of the MPUD. The 400 units equates to a density of 16 dwelling units per acre over the 25-acre site. The Urban Residential Subdistrict density rating system permits a discretionary base density of four dwelling units per acre. Density bonuses are permitted for affordable housing a maximum bonus of up to 12 dwelling units per acre for qualifying income category housing. While all the property to be developed within the PUD for golf course and green ways uses would be eligible to be used for the calculation of residential density, this would equate to a maximum density of approximately 480 dwelling units at the base density of 4 dwelling units per acre and nearly 2,000 units if the affordable housing density bonus is utilized. The maximum of 400 dwelling proposed equates to a density of 16 dwelling units per acre over just the area to be leased by Rural Neighborhoods and an approximate density of 3.3 dwelling units per acre over the entire site. In either case, the density proposed is below that eligible under the density rating system. Rural Neighborhoods has entered into a Developer Agreement with Collier County, which identifies eligible income qualifying levels consistent with that outlined in the density rating system.

The MPUD also identifies a 13.5+/- acre tract which is the location where Collier County may establish up to 75,000 square feet of a variety of general governmental/public service uses. The 6.1+/- Residential Tourist tract will permit uses consistent with the RT zoning district and the C-3 Intermediate Commercial zoning district. While some of the included uses are permitted by right in the Urban Residential Subdistrict, some of the proposed uses are not permitted; therefore, a companion small-scale amendment has been filed which proposes to establish the Collier County Government Public Services and Residential Tourist Subdistrict. The new subdistrict provides for a variety of general governmental, public service uses, institutional uses, residential dwelling units and commercial uses. The specific list of permitted uses in this MPUD are consistent with the allowed uses in the Subdistrict.

Objective 1.2 and Policy 1.2.1 require that projects must be consistent with level of service standards and concurrency requirements for public facilities as outlined in the Capital Facilities Element of the Growth Management Plan. There are no identified LOS deficiencies currently, nor anticipated with the redevelopment of the property as a mixed-use project. The MPUD is consistent with this Objective and Policy of the GGAMP.

Objective 1.3 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element requires the protection and preservation of natural resources within Golden Gate City. The property has been previously cleared and filled and has predominantly been utilized as a golf course since the 1960's. A vegetative analysis, including a tree survey, and listed species study has been completed and is included in this MPUD application. While the site does not contain native indigenous vegetation, the golf course conversion standards in the LDC do require preservation or replanting of many of the existing trees within the proposed greenways shown on the MPUD Conceptual Master Plan.

Objective 2.1 and Policy 2.1.1 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element require development and redevelopment to be guided by the residential and commercial needs consistent with the vision of Golden Gate City. This MPUD represents redevelopment of a defunct golf course into a vibrant mixed-use project that will provide for both residential and non-residential uses consistent with expressed public policy for Golden Gate City.

Policy 2.3.2 of the Golden Gate City Sub-element provides that Collier County will support all transportation needs with an emphasis on walkability. The proposed MPUD provides for walkability both internal and external. Sidewalks will be provided along both the Collier Boulevard and Golden Gate Parkway frontages, which will also provide for the connection to the provided greenways within the project. A potential pedestrian interconnection is provided adjacent to the residential tract, which will provide the opportunity for area residents to access the southern portion of the greenway, and to provide linkages to the public schools located near the MPUD.

2. The existing land use pattern.

The property is located at the intersection of two arterial roadways. The property has been developed as a golf course, restaurant, hotel and small commercial tract since the 1960's and is surrounded to the east by Collier Boulevard ROW, to the south by the Golden Gate Canal, to the west by single family dwelling units and to the north by Golden Gate Parkway. Along Golden Gate Parkway, the property is adjacent to timeshare multi-family units, and single-family dwelling units. A utility site owned by Collier County is located internal to the MPUD; however, that parcel is excluded from this MPUD.

3. The possible creation of an isolated district unrelated to adjacent and nearby districts.

The MPUD is for property under the ownership of the applicants and therefore no isolated district is being created. The property meets all design standards for a PUD and is consistent with the LDC.

4. Whether existing district boundaries are illogically drawn in relation to existing conditions on the property proposed for change.

The boundaries are not illogically drawn and comprise all of the property under the unified control of the applicants.

5. Whether changed or changing conditions make the passage of the proposed amendment necessary.

The Collier County Board of County Commissioners acquired 165+/- acres of the property in 2019 with the expressed purpose of evaluating public uses, including retention of a golf course, that could be developed on the property. The County has already entered into an agreement

with Rural Neighborhoods to develop up to 400 affordable/workforce housing units on a portion of the site. Except for a 2.4+/- portion of the site, which is zoned commercial today, and the 6.1+/- acre hotel site, all of the balance of the property is zoned GC, Golf Course. In order to develop the mix of uses proposed by Collier County, the rezoning is necessary.

6. Whether the proposed change will adversely influence living conditions in the neighborhood.

The MPUD document includes development standards to ensure that it is compatible with the immediately surrounding properties. The MPUD master plan identifies appropriate buffers and open spaces, which will further ensure that the development will have no adverse impacts to the neighborhood.

7. Whether the proposed change will create or excessively increase traffic congestion or create types of traffic deemed incompatible with surrounding land uses, because of peak volumes or projected types of vehicular traffic, including activity during construction phases of the development, or otherwise affect public safety.

A traffic impact analysis has been submitted in support of the proposed rezone. No level of service issues have been identified. The character of traffic will not be discernably different than that historically permitted for the subject property, or the type of traffic currently utilizing Golden Gate Parkway and Collier Boulevard. Golden Gate Parkway and Collier Boulevard serves existing commercial and residential uses.

8. Whether the proposed change will create a drainage problem.

The project will be required to obtain an Environmental Resource Permit (ERP) through the South Florida Water Management District. The ERP review evaluates historic surface water flows and controls the off-site discharge of stormwater from the site. The project will have internal water management facilities including detention areas to control the drainage for the project. No drainage issues will result from this project.

9. Whether the proposed change will seriously reduce light and air to adjacent areas.

Given the limitation on building heights, setbacks, buffering, and extensive open space use of the site, there will be no reduction in light or air for adjacent properties.

10. Whether the proposed change will adversely affect property values in the adjacent area.

The Conceptual Master Plan for the property has carefully located proposed uses in locations that will not adversely impact property values in the surrounding areas. The redevelopment of the defunct golf course and commercial development area will likely spur further redevelopment and have positive impacts to surrounding property values.

11. Whether the proposed change will be a deterrent to the improvement or development of adjacent property in accordance with existing regulations.

The proposed zoning change will not be a deterrent to improvement or development of adjacent property. The proposed mixed-use project will act as a catalyst for further redevelopment consistent with the Golden Gate City Sub-element of the GGAMP and the Economic Development Zone designation.

12. Whether the proposed change will constitute a grant of special privilege to an individual owner as contrasted with the public welfare.

The proposed MPUD will not grant special privilege to an individual owner. The MPUD will remain in public and private ownership and the proposed redevelopment scenario will be in the public interest.

13. Whether there are substantial reasons why the property cannot be used in accordance with existing zoning.

The property, with the exception of approximately 8.5 acres, is zoned for golf course use only. The golf course zoning district permits the golf and driving range component; however, other uses such as the affordable/workforce housing, nursing home/assisted living facility, commercial uses and general governmental office uses are not permitted in the golf course zoning district; therefore, a rezoning to a MPUD is required.

14. Whether the change suggested is out of scale with the needs of the neighborhood or the county.

The proposed rezone is in scale with the needs of the neighborhood and Collier County and is consistent with the redevelopment of the site envisioned by Collier County.

15. Whether it is impossible to find other adequate sites in the county for the proposed use in districts already permitting such use.

It is not impossible to find other sites in Collier County for the mix of uses proposed for the property. However, Collier County is an owner of approximately 165+/- acres of the property which was acquired with the intent to develop the site with multiple public benefit land uses. The property is also within a designated Economic Development Zone and the proposed MPUD is intended to be a catalyst for further development and redevelopment in Golden Gate City consistent with stated goals, objectives and policies of the GGAMP, Golden Gate City Sub-element.

16. The physical characteristics of the property and the degree of site alteration which would be required to make the property usable for any of the range of potential uses under the proposed zoning classification.

A majority of the site is developed as a golf course. A golf course designer has yet to be retained by Collier County; therefore, the degree to which the redeveloped golf course will require site alteration is unknown at this time. Areas of the existing golf course to be redeveloped for affordable housing, governmental offices, commercial uses, and a nursing home/assisted living facility will require site alteration. The redevelopment will include a master stormwater system that will require some further alteration of the site in order to accommodate all of the proposed uses on the site. Because the site has been previously filled it is not anticipated that large quantities of fill dirt will be required to be imported to the site. The commercial and RT areas have been developed and the MPUD will allow the uses to remain or to be redeveloped consistent with the uses permitted in the MPUD.

17. The impact of development on the availability of adequate public facilities and services consistent with the levels of service adopted in the Collier County Growth Management Plan and as defined and implemented through the Collier County Adequate Public Facilities Ordinance [Code ch. 106, art. II], as amended.

There are adequate roadways and utilities available at the site. There are no public facilities deficiencies at the present time, and none will occur as a result of this project.

18. Such other factors, standards, or criteria that the Board of County Commissioners shall deem important in the protection of the public health, safety, and welfare.

The project is consistent with the Growth Management Plan, and it is compatible with surrounding development. This MPUD represents an opportunity to utilize a public asset for multiple public purposes including a public golf course and much needed affordable workforce housing uses. The inclusion of the commercial and residential tourist uses will provide for opportunities for redevelopment consistent with the companion small-scale plan amendment and MPUD.